

City Planning and Development Department Citywide Planning Division Historic Preservation Office

16th Floor, City Hall, Room 1603 414 East 12th Street Kansas City, Missouri 64106-2795 kchp@kcmo.org

(816) 513-2902 Fax (816) 513-2899

Before the Historic Preservation Commission of Kansas City, Missouri

Commission Members Present Commission Members Absent

Robert Gangwere Mike Hardin Erik Heitman David Matthews Joe Mattox Patrick Bustos Raymond Doswell Andrew Ray

The special meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 2:05 p.m., **August 6, 2014,** by the Chairman, **Erik Heitman**, in the Council Dining Room, 8th Floor, City Hall.

Erik Heitman, Chairman, asked Bradley Wolf, City Historic Preservation Officer, to please stand and be sworn in.

Approval of Minutes

Minutes Approved – June 13, 2014, June 27, 2014 Minutes Continued – April 25, 2014, May 30, 2014

Projects

Modern Survey Grant

Bradley Wolf, City Historic Preservation Officer, been duly sworn in, presented the application for the Modern Survey grant for non-single family modern buildings in Kansas City. He stated that the grant would be for 2015.

Mike Hardin made a motion to support the grant application for the Modern Survey.

Joe Mattox seconded the motion and the Historic Preservation Commission **approved** the motion by a vote of 5/0 (members Gangwere, Hardin, Heitman, Matthews and Mattox)

Certificate of Appropriateness

Case No. 2291-C
3219 Central Street
'Greystone Historic District'
(install vinyl siding and soffits)

Quorum: No quorum established

Bradley Wolf, City Historic Preservation Officer, been duly sworn in, presented the Staff Report stating that the applicant, **Gloria Cervantez**, requests approval to install vinyl siding and soffits on the property at **3219 Central Street,** a contributing property in the **'Greystone Historic District.'**

That the following exhibits were introduced in the Staff Report and admitted as evidence:

EXHIBIT A - Historic Preservation Commission Ordinance

EXHIBIT B - Chapter 88-580 and 88-585 of the Development Code

EXHIBIT C - Rules and Regulations of the Historic Preservation Commission

EXHIBIT D - Application

EXHIBIT E - Affidavit of Publication

EXHIBIT F - Affidavit of Mailing

EXHIBIT G - Staff Report

EXHIBIT H - Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

EXHIBIT I - Designation Ordinance #941442

EXHIBIT J - Kansas City Urban Design Guidelines

EXHIBIT K - Kansas City Historic Resources Survey Form

EXHIBIT L - Map

EXHIBIT M - Photographs

EXHIBIT N – Vinyl Siding

EXHIBIT O - Vinyl Soffits EXHIBIT P - 1940 Photograph

That the applicant and property owner, Gloria Cervantes, and the project contractor, Robert Brady, were in attendance to answer questions and were duly sworn. Mrs. Cervantes talked to the siding and how it would significantly reduce the utility costs, that the changes would more closely resemble the original siding, and that this was her family house. The Mr. Brady talked to the costs of restoring the siding, the character of the proposed siding, the project budget and the long term maintenance costs.

That the Commission discussed the existing asbestos shingles, the proposed vinyl siding, if mitered corners were available for the siding, if there was a cost estimate for removal of the asbestos and an estimate for the restoration of the original siding.

That staff stated that the 1940 photograph has a poor resolution, but the siding appears to be lap which is similar to the proposed vinyl siding.

That no person spoke in opposition to the proposal.

Mike Hardin made a motion to continue the case to allow time for the applicant to gather information on the costs of removing the asbestos shingles and restoring the siding and alternatives for a mitered corner for the vinyl siding.

Joe Mattox seconded the motion and the Historic Preservation Commission **continued** the case by a vote of <u>5/0</u> (members Gangwere, Hardin, Heitman, Matthews and Mattox)

Case No. 2293-C
500 East 44th Street
'Southmoreland Historic District'
(construct addition and final approval of porte-cochere)

Quorum: No quorum established

Bradley Wolf, City Historic Preservation Officer, been duly sworn in, presented the Staff Report stating that the applicant, Ron Schaffer, Architect, requests approval to construct addition and final approval of porte-cochere on the property at 500 East 44th Street, a contributing property in the 'Southmoreland Historic District.'

That the following exhibits were introduced in the Staff Report and admitted as evidence:

EXHIBIT A - Historic Preservation Commission Ordinance

EXHIBIT B - Chapter 88-580 and 88-585 of the Development Code

EXHIBIT C - Rules and Regulations of the Historic Preservation Commission

EXHIBIT D - Application

EXHIBIT E - Affidavit of Publication

EXHIBIT F - Affidavit of Mailing

EXHIBIT G - Staff Report

EXHIBIT H - Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

EXHIBIT I - Designation Ordinance #54574

EXHIBIT J - Kansas City Urban Design Guidelines

EXHIBIT K - Kansas City Historic Resources Survey Form

EXHIBIT L - Map

EXHIBIT M - Photographs

EXHIBIT N – Plans

EXHIBIT O - Photo Renderings

EXHIBIT P - Stone Sample

That the following new exhibit was introduced and admitted as evidence:

EXHIBIT Q - Letter of Opposition

EXHIBIT R - Petition of support from neighbors

That the applicant Ronald Schaffer, AIA, and property owner, Chuck Devoe were in attendance to answer questions and were duly sworn. Mr. Schaffer and Devoe talked to the heating and cooling needs of the enclosed side porches and that the tower would address those needs. The applicant stated that adding the tower on the rear of the porches would block the basement entrance and would be difficult due to the need to move utilities. That the applicant talked to the design of the porch and how it would be compatible with the elements of the house. The applicant also presented a petition of support from neighbors.

That the Commission discussed the Tudor elements of the house, the scale and massing of the house and the proposed addition, the materials of the addition, the visibility of the addition and the rear porte-cochere and if the applicant had explored all options for the heating and cooling needs.

That staff stated that the porte-cochere has limited visibility from the public right of way and that the details of the railing and finials would match the design of the house.

That no person spoke to the proposal.

Motion #1

Mike Hardin made a motion to approve the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the railing and final details on the porte-cochere in that it is in conformance with the **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #9 and 10.**

Robert Gangwere seconded the motion and the Historic Preservation Commission **approved** the portion of the case for the railing and final details on the porte-cochere by a vote of <u>4/1</u> (members Gangwere, Hardin, Matthews and Mattox in favor, member Heitman opposed)

Motion #2

Mike Hardin made a motion to deny the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct addition in that it is in violation with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #2 and 9.

Robert Gangwere seconded the motion and the Historic Preservation Commission **denied** the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct addition by a vote of **5/0** (members Gangwere, Hardin, Heitman, Matthews and Mattox)

Case No. 2294-C 420 Olive Street

'Pendleton Heights Historic District'

(paint exterior, remove door, install window, remove concrete pad)

Quorum: No quorum established

Bradley Wolf, City Historic Preservation Officer, been duly sworn in, presented the Staff Report stating that the applicant, Candace Davis, requests approval to paint exterior, remove doors, install window and door, remove concrete pad on the property at 420 Olive Street, a contributing property in the 'Pendleton Heights Historic District.'

That the following exhibits were introduced in the Staff Report and admitted as evidence:

EXHIBIT A - Historic Preservation Commission Ordinance

EXHIBIT B - Chapter 88-580 and 88-585 of the Development Code

EXHIBIT C - Rules and Regulations of the Historic Preservation Commission

EXHIBIT D - Application

EXHIBIT E - Affidavit of Publication

EXHIBIT F - Affidavit of Mailing

EXHIBIT G - Staff Report

EXHIBIT H - Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

EXHIBIT I - Designation Ordinance #920408

EXHIBIT J - Kansas City Urban Design Guidelines

EXHIBIT K - Kansas City Historic Resources Survey Form

EXHIBIT L - Map

EXHIBIT M - Photographs

EXHIBIT N - Paint Scheme

EXHIBIT O - Front Door

That the following new exhibit was introduced and admitted as evidence:

EXHIBIT P - Design

That the applicant, Candace Davis, was in attendance to answer questions and was duly sworn.

That the Commission discussed the new window, the paint scheme and the front yard and retaining wall.

That no person spoke in opposition to the proposal.

Mike Hardin made a motion to approve the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint exterior, remove doors, install door and window, and remove the concrete pad is in conformance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #2, 5 and 9.*

Joe Mattox seconded the motion and the Historic Preservation Commission **approved** the case by a vote of <u>5/0</u> (members Gangwere, Hardin, Heitman, Matthews and Mattox)

National Register of Historic Places

Kansas City Parks and Boulevard Historic District Kansas City, Jackson County, Missouri

Bradley Wolf, City Historic Preservation Officer, having been duly sworn in, presented the Staff Report stating that the applicant, Cydney Millstein, Architectural and Historical Research, LLC, requests recommendation for inclusion of The Kansas City Parks and Boulevard Historic District on the National Register of Historic Places.

That the preparer of the nomination, **Cydney Millstein**, made a brief presentation and spoke in favor of the nomination.

That no one spoke in opposition to the nomination.

Joe Mattox made a motion to recommend approval of the nomination for the Kansas City Parks and Boulevard Historic District.

Mike Hardin seconded the motion and the Historic Preservation Commission **recommended approval** of the nomination by a vote of <u>5/0</u> (members Gangwere, Hardin, Heitman, Matthews and Mattox)

Certificate of Appropriateness

Case No. 2272-C
3719 Walnut Street
'Old Hyde Park Historic District'
(replace front door and windows, paint exterior)

Quorum: No quorum established

Automatically continued to August 22, 2014 hearing due to lack of quorum.

Section 106 Review – Exempt Activities

All cases continued to August 22, 2014 meeting due to lack of quorum.

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0228: 5541 NE Munger Rd

'5541 NE Munger NNI CS Program'

(replace gutters and downspouts, paint garage doors, siding, trim and handrails, repair exterior outlet, install retaining wall drain)

Exempt by Section III.B.2.f.4 and 8, III.B.1.a of the Programmatic Agreement

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0230: 4927 Woodland Ave

'4927 Woodland Blue Hills MHR'

(replace a/c unit, repair electrical, repair stone retaining wall inkind)

Exempt by Section III.B.1.a, III.B.2.h and III.B.3.b of the Programmatic Agreement

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0231: 5112 Highland Ave

'5112 Highland Blue Hills MHR'

(replace roof, replace furnace, a/c and hot water tank, upgrade electrical service)

Exempt by Section III.B.2.f.8, III.B.3.a, b and c of the Programmatic Agreement

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0232: 5800 Askew Ave

'5800 Askew Ave Blue Hills MHR'

(replace furnace, a/c and hot water tank; replace water supply, upgrade electrical panel) *Exempt by Section III.B.3.a, b and c of the Programmatic Agreement*

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0233: 5810 Park Ave

'5810 Park Blue Hills MHR'

(repair kitchen drain line, repair shower, replace electrical receptacles, paint exterior, replace front porch steps inkind, replace sidewalk inkind)

Exempt by Section III.B.3.a, b and c, and III.B.1.b, III.B.2.7 of the Programmatic Agreement

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0237: 1601-07 E 18th St

'Lincoln Building HVAC'

(replace ductwork in HVAC system)

Exempt by Section III.B.3.a of the Programmatic Agreement

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0238: 5517 Agnes Ave

'5517 Agnes Blue Hills MHR'

(replace roofing and hot water tank)

Exempt by Section III.A.1 of the Programmatic Agreement

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0239: 5618 Garfield Ave

'5618 Garfield Blue Hills MHR'

(replace roofing, upgrade electrical service, replace hot water heater and a/c unit, repair basement walls and dining room ceiling, repair basement door)

Exempt by Section III.B.2.f.8, III.B.3.a, b and e of the Programmatic Agreement

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0240: 5515 Brooklyn Ave

'5515 Brooklyn Blue Hills MHR'

(replace a/c unit, repair gutters and kitchen ceiling, repair porch structure and footings, replace bathroom vanity, flooring and floor joist)

Exempt by Section III.B.2.f.7 and 8, III.B.3.i and III.B.2.h of the Programmatic Agreement

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0241: 3400 Wayne Ave

'3400 Wayne Ave INC MHR'

(replace roofing and kitchen floor)

Exempt by Section III.A.1 of the Programmatic Agreement

SECTION 106 REVIEW NONEXEMPT ACTIVITES

All cases continued to August 22, 2014 meeting due to lack of quorum.

No Historic Properties Effected Recommendation

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0227: 1511 NE 51st St

'1511 NE 51st St NNI CS Program'

(repair window pane, replace furnace and a/c unit, replace front entry door, grade)

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0229: 3719 N Cypress Dr

'3719 N Cypress Ave NNI CS Program'

(replace entry door, furnace, a/c unit, storm door, handrail, gutters and downspouts)

No Adverse Effect Recommendation

106 Case No. 2014-HUD-0214: 3436 Wabash Ave

'3436 Wabash Ave INC MHR'

(replace fascia, gutters and downspouts, repair waterline and drain, replace back porch and steps)

Discussion Items

Enforcement Strategies – continued to August 22, 2014 due to lack of quorum

The meeting was adjourned at 4:36 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Heather Gilbride

Administrative Assistant

Heather Gilbride